TEMPLATE 3 – OTM-R Checklist

Case number: 2019ES391598

Name Organisation under review: Spanish National Research Council (CSIC)

Organisation's contact details: Ana María Orejas (ana.orejas@csic.es)

SUBMISSION DATE: 20/03/2019

DATE ENDORSEMENT CHARTER AND CODE: 26/03/2019

OTM-R Checklist

A specific self-assessment checklist is provided for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment (OTM-R). Please report on the status of achievement, also detail on the indicators and the form of measurement used.

OTM-R checklist for organisations					
	Open	**Trans-parent**	**Merit-based**	**Answer:** **++ Yes,** ***completely*** ***+/-Yes,*** ***substantially*** ***-/+ Yes,*** ***partially*** ***-- No***	***Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)**
OTM-R system					
1. Have we published a version of our OTM-R policy online (in the national language and in English)?	x	x	x	***-- No***	Nowadays, there is not a single of CSIC OTM-R Policy document. There is a "Staff Management Manual" https://saco.csic.es/index.php/s/Pa3yrtzSDa43Qmq , which compiles a set of documents available on the intranet (e.g. transparency, protocols, etc.). This document is in the national language, not in English. A new action will compile the relevant aspects of the OTM-R included in these

					documents in a single one, which will summarize the CSIC's OTM-R Policy. A specific working group will be organized to review the current CSIC recruitment system and to design the new OTM-R policy applicable to all kind of job offers in the CSIC. The CSIC is an institution included within the subjective scope of application of the Act 19/2013 of transparency (LTAIPBG), access to public information and good government. The CSIC complies with the obligations of active advertising derived from the LTAIPBG. Indicator: OTM-R policy published on the external website.
2. Do we have an internal guide setting out clear OTM-R procedures and practices for all types of positions?	x	x	x	*-/+ Yes, partially*	There are clear procedures only for permanent researchers. For temporary researchers, "Staff Management Manual" and job bank procedures provide procedures to be followed. The RRHH intranet section provide extensive information on procedures and processes for all types of positions. Indicator: Guide published on the internal website.
3. Is everyone involved in the process sufficiently trained in the area of OTM-R?	x	x	x	*-/+ Yes, partially*	No. A training programme on OTM-R policy is been proposed as a new action. Indicator: Existence of training programs for OTM-R. Indicator: Number of staff following training in OTM-R
4. Do we make (sufficient) use of e-recruitment tools?	x	x		*-/+ Yes, partially*	Electronic Office where you can consult all the information related to specific calls for permanent and temporary employment in the CSIC and other calls. Indicator: Number of vacancies for each staff category.
5. Do we have a quality control system for OTM-R in place?	x	x	x	*-/+ Yes, partially*	Once the OTM-R policy is implemented, the SGARH will be in charge of monitoring and controlling the OTM-R process instead.
6. Does our current OTM-R policy encourage external candidates to apply?	x	x	x	*-/+ Yes, partially*	Partial research advertisements are posted on the CSIC website [Vacancies] https://www.csic.es/es/formacion-y-empleo All recruitments are open competitions with no advertisement restricted to internal applicants. A specific action, within the HRS4R action plan, will establish a mechanism to automatically advertise on our website and on the Euraxess portal.

					The CSIC partially advertises research positions on the Euraxess website. Indicator: Trend in the share of applicants from outside the organisation.
7. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract researchers from abroad?	x	x	x	*-/+ Yes, partially*	Specific actions are proposed in the Action Plan. It has been noted that Spain´s comparatively low salaries often discourage high-level candidates from abroad. Not all offers are published in English on the CSIC´s website. CSIC has a subscription newsletter for vacant positions, circulating as widely as possible, which often includes collaborating institutions at the international level. VICYT, SEGE and VRI also work for assess, advice and support in the recruitment of international researchers. Our Institution is represented in several international organizations and networks. Indicator: Trend in the share of applicants from abroad.
8. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract underrepresented groups?	x	x	x	*-/+ Yes, partially*	The announcement of positions does not restrict access to underrepresented groups. No information related to age, sex or race or any other aspect that could directly or indirectly discriminate is taken into consideration in the recruitment process Selection committees are gender balanced, in compliance with the provisions of article 53 of Organic Law 3/2007 of March 22 for the effective equality of women and men. Recommendations for achieving gender balance are included in the management for the courts of selective processes for access as civil servants. This is one of the objectives of the CSIC's Delegate Commission for Equality, which will participate in the preparation of the new CSIC OTM-R policy. Indicator: Number of applicants and trend in the participation of underrepresented groups (usually women).
9. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to provide attractive working conditions for researchers?	x	x	x	*-/+ Yes, partially*	Several actions have been taken to offer attractive working conditions to researchers, such as work flexibility, work-family balance (e.g., childcare facilities), paid leaves for vacation, excellent insurance coverage (Social Security of the Spanish National Health System), travel agency, catering and health facilities.

					In less than 10 years the CSIC has already developed two gender equality plans for its implementation in the coming years. Indicator: Number of applicants; trend of applicants per position; trend in the share of applicants from outside the organization.
10. Do we have means to monitor whether the most suitable researchers apply?				*-- No*	There is not a monitoring system in place to check it. Trend in the qualification level of applicants.
Advertising and application phase					
11. Do we have clear guidelines or templates (e.g., EURAXESS) for advertising positions?	x	x		*-/+ Yes, partially*	In general, there is no existence of templates adapted to all types of job. Hosting offers for PhD vacancies within specific calls for proposals (grants for pre-doc contracts for the training of doctors and grants for the training of university teachers).
12. Do we include in the job advertisement references/links to all the elements foreseen in the relevant section of the toolkit?	x	x		*-- No*	Job advertisement and description of requirements are not as concise as possible and no links to more detailed information online are included.
13. Do we make full use of EURAXESS to ensure our research vacancies reach a wider audience?	x	x		*-/+ Yes, partially*	Certain R4 civil servants (Tenured Scientist) positions and MSCA type vacancies from ITN and H2020 projects. Indicator: The share of job adverts posted on EURAXESS. Indicator: Trend in the share of applicants recruited from outside the organization/abroad.
14. Do we make use of other job advertising tools?	x	x		*-/+ Yes, partially*	We use advertising tools, such as Madri+d, Professional associations, universities, etc. Offers are often also published in other channels including social media. Share of vacancies advertised in other means.
15. Do we keep the administrative burden to a minimum for the candidate?	x			*-/+ Yes, partially*	That is one of our priorities. However, since the applicants themselves are responsible for ensuring that the application is complete, and there are many details and documents to be submitted, it is a significant time investment for job applicants. As the CSIC is using a job bank as the selection mechanism to access the positions of temporal work linked to research projects, agreements and contracts, the administrative burden for applicants decreases. The portal

					allows easy uploading of the required documents in some cases, the application forms require the input of a large amount of data and information. As a Public Organism, the CSIC uses the service of "Gestión Integrada de Servicios de Registro" (GEISER), which covers both the management of its entry / exit registration offices and the reception and sending of records in the documentation processing units.
Selection and evaluation phase					
16. Do we have clear rules governing the appointment of selection committees?		x	x	*+/-Yes, substantially*	The Selection Committee is different depending on the selection process for the vacancies or jobs. There is a specific committee appointment process for job bank selection processes and another for R4 civil servants. The recruitment framework followed by CSIC is set out by national rules. There is a handbook for members of the selection committees for R4 positions (http://sac.csic.es/sgarh/tribunales/doc/manual%20tribunales%20cientifico.pdf only in Spanish), details about the appointment of selection committees are included in the manual. General rules have been included in specific protocols. The internal regulation fixes the criteria for the composition of commissions. However, not all the elements mentioned in Chapter 4.4.2.a within the Report of the working group of the steering group of human resources management under the European Research Area on OTM-R are followed. Indicators: Statistics on the composition of panels.
17. Do we have clear rules concerning the composition of selection committees?		x	x	*+/-Yes, substantially*	In relation to number 16, the recruitment framework followed by CSIC is set out by national rules. A legal framework, which implies all reference to the process, falls under a Presidency Resolution https://sede.csic.gob.es/servicios/formacion-y-empleo/bolsa-de-trabajo only in Spanish). There is a handbook for members of the selection committees for R4 positions (http://sac.csic.es/sgarh/tribunales/doc/manual%20tribunales%20cientifico.pdf only in Spanish), details about the appointment of selection committees are included in the manual. The new CSIC-OTM-R policy will include detailed rules for the composition (including gender-balance) of selection committees.

Question					Assessment	Description
						Indicators: Written guidelines.
18. Are the committees sufficiently gender-balanced?		x	x		**++ Yes, completely**	There are only clear guidelines for permanent vacancies established by national rules. The new CSIC´s OTM-R policy will include detailed rules for the composition (including gender-balance) of selection committees. Indicators: Statistics on the composition of panels.
19. Do we have clear guidelines for selection committees which help to judge 'merit' in a way that leads to the best candidate being selected?			x		**-/+ Yes, partially**	There are clear guidelines only for permanent vacancies established by national rules. The new CSIC-OTM-R policy will include detailed rules to help to judge merits. Indicators: Written guidelines.
Appointment phase						
20. Do we inform all applicants at the end of the selection process?		x			**-/+ Yes, partially**	Within the CSIC´s job bank, the Selection Commission prepare the provisional lists of the applicants who have been selected for each hiring request with their respective final assessments. These provisional lists are made public by including them in the corresponding section of the CSIC website. For R4 civil servant positions, at the end of each exercise of the process, the list of approvals is published in alphabetical order at the place or places of the exercise, as well as in the seat of the Committee (CSIC´s website). At the end of the process, the sum of the qualifications achieved in the existing phases is published, as well as the list of opponents who have passed the selective process, sorted by score and submitted to the convening authority for publication in the BOE. The new CSIC-OTM-R policy will include detailed rules for the information process at the end of the selection process.
21. Do we provide adequate feedback to interviewees?		x			**-/+ Yes, partially**	For permanent positions, yes, but only if the applicant asks for it. For temporary positions (job bank), there is an internal rule.

22. Do we have an appropriate complaints mechanism in place?		x		-/+ Yes, partially	For R4 positions, the committee must resolve the claims and inform the administrative resources (Law 39/2015). For temporary positions, through CSIC´s job bank, the applicant has one month to lodge an appeal. Indicator: Statistics of complaints.
Overall assessment					
23. Do we have a system in place to assess whether OTM-R delivers on its objectives?				**-- No**	The "OTM-R Working Team", will follow up of the implementation and progression of the adaptation to the OTM-R system (continuing internal monitoring).